

Concordia University  
Council of the John Molson School of Business  
Minutes of the meeting held  
Friday, April 23, 2004

Present: J. Tomberlin (Chair)  
K. Argheyd (Mana.), C. Bayne (DS&MIS), S. Betton (Fina.), O. Bodur (Mktg.),  
D. Cameron (Mana.), A. Dhillon, A. Fagnoli (Reg.), G. Fisher (Econ.),  
S. Fontaine (Staff), J. Freed (Fina.), M. Genova (Staff), S. K. Goyal (DS&MIS),  
S. Hoffman (Lib.), Z. Gidengil (Mktg.), N. Howe (SGS), A. B. Ibrahim (Assoc.  
Dean), G. Kanaan (Assoc. Dean), D. Kira (DS&MIS), R. Knitter (Mana.),  
I. Leduc (CASA), G. Lowenfeld (Acco.), G. Lypny (Fina.), M. Magnan (Assoc.  
Dean), J. McConnell (CASA), D. Morin (Assoc. Dean), S. Mustafa (Acco.), F.  
Nebebe (DS&MIS), T. O'Connell (Mana.), R. J. Oppenheimer (Mana.), D. Peltier-  
Rivest (Acco.), K. Chin Quee (CGSA), I. Rakita (Fina.), A. Robin (CASA),  
M. Sharma (DS&MIS), C. Y. Suen (Comp.Sci.), M. Wichterle (CASA)

Absent with  
Regret: J. Ahmad, T. Alameddine, P. Bolla, A.-M. Croteau, R. Ferguson, E. Gatbonton  
(TESL), K. Lafronboise (DS&MIS), J. Lightstone (Provost), F. Lowy (Rector),  
M. Perugini (CASA), S. Robinson (Acco.), C. A. Ross (Mktg.), K. Soufani (Fina.),  
M. Thakor (Mktg.), M.-E. Turcotte (CASA), M. Wou (CASA)

I Call to Order  
The meeting was called to order at 9:35 a.m.

II Closed Meeting

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

III Open Meeting

IV Approval of Agenda - JMSB-2004-04A

*It was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by G. Lowenfeld that Council approve the  
agenda as presented. The motion was carried unanimously.*

**V Approval of the Minutes - JMSB-2004-03M**

*It was moved by A. Dhillon and seconded by S. Hoffman that Council approve the minutes of the meeting held March 12<sup>th</sup> as presented.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

**VI Chair's Report and Question Period (maximum 15 minutes)**

J. Tomberlin reported on the success of this year's Best of the Best event that raised over \$110,000 for Ph.D. Fellowships. Coupled with the National Bank scholarships of \$100,000 a year and the Concordia Ph.D. Fellowships totaling to \$300,000 per year the JMSB would expect to see growth in the Ph.D. Program.

With regard to the achievements of JMSB students, the Dean reported:

. In March, JMSB undergraduate students finished first in the Network of International Business Schools competition hosted by Memorial University in Newfoundland.

Concordia will host the competition next year.

. In late March, a JMSB undergraduate team took third place at the International Undergraduate Case Competition hosted by Royal Roads University in Victoria.

. Twenty-eight JMSB undergraduates competed in the largest marketing competition in Eastern Canada in late March and came in first for the second consecutive year.

. Two MBA students placed second in the sixth annual Ivey Business Plan Competition.

This is the third consecutive year where our MBA students have placed in the top two of this prestigious competition.

. A team of students from the Ken Woods Portfolio Management program placed first in the annual Portfolio Management Competition hosted by the University of Dayton.

. The Business Planning Competition held at Queen's was won by a JMSB undergraduate student.

J. Tomberlin commented that the Faculty has great reason to be proud of JMSB students who have surpassed themselves in this year's international competitions. He congratulated everyone who played a role in the competitions.

With regard to the strategic plan, he advised that the first draft of the plan had been presented to the Associate Deans and members of the Faculty Academic Programs Committee last week. Presentations to faculty, staff and student executives will be scheduled during the next few weeks. The implementation plan will be developed during the summer and the strategic plan would be presented to Council in the fall.

**VII Elections – JMSB-2004-03A-02**

**i) JMSB Student Request Committee**

M. Bergier, Marketing Department, was elected to represent the department for a one-year period, June 1, 2004 – May 31, 2005

**ii) Council of the School of Graduate Studies**

G. Saad, Marketing Department, was elected to represent the department for a three-year period, June 1, 2004 – May 31, 2007

**VIII Business Arising from Previous Meeting**

**i) JMSB Programs – Inventory of Partnerships, Joint Ventures and Joint Initiatives – JMSB-2004-04A-02**

*It was moved by M. Magnan and seconded by G. Lowenfeld that Council receive the Inventory of Partnerships, Joint Ventures and Joint initiatives.*

*It was noted that all graduate program agreements must be vetted by the School of Graduate Studies.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

- ii) **Motion to Amend the Guidelines for Advisory Search Committees for Graduate Program Directors – JMSB-2004-04A-03**

*It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by M. Magnan that Council approve the amendments to the Guidelines for Advisory Search Committees for Graduation Program Directors as presented in document JMSB-2004-04A-03.*

In response to a question about the sense of "normally" in the third amendment, D. Morin advised that, similar to the University calendar, it implies that there may be exceptions when an appointment would be longer than one year. A discussion ensued regarding the appropriate wording that would give the Dean the flexibility to make an interim appointment for more than one year.

*It was moved by A. Dhillon and seconded by A. Robin that the third amendment be revised to read: the Dean may appoint an interim GPD for a period of up to eighteen months.*

*The mover and the seconder agreed to the amendment.*

*The motion was unanimously carried as amended.*

- iii) **Committee Compositions and Mandates – reference page 6 JMSB-2004-01M – JMSB-2004-04A-04**

*It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by G. Lowenfeld that Council approve the Committee Compositions and Mandates as presented in documents JMSB-2004-04A-04.*

D. Morin advised that the documents have been reviewed and approved by FAPC.

During the discussion one faculty member questioned why the mandates and compositions were not uniform noting the differences in the EMBA and AMBA department representation and quorum. D. Morin advised that there was no intention of standardizing the mandates and compositions of the committees, the goal was to have a uniform presentation format including the mandate, quorum, general function, the meeting schedule, sub-committees etc.

Strong concern was expressed that, with the exception of the Ph.D., M.Sc. and DIADSA Program Committees, there was no mention of the role of the committees' in the admission process. It was pointed out that admission was the responsibility of the School of Graduate Studies based on the recommendations of the graduate program. It was reported that MBA admissions were currently processed by the MBA staff. It was noted that the Appraisal Committee of the MBA Program was deliberating the composition of the MBA Admissions

committee. One member of Council stated that all graduate programs were required to have admission committees.

The Chair pointed out that while each committee determines the best way of carrying out the mandate, there is consistency among the programs with regard to the quality of the program namely the curriculum, program administration, admissions, graduation requirements – all academic program issues. He suggested that the mandates be approved and comments for fine-tuning be sent back to the programs.

One member of Council objected to the MBA selection process for committee representatives. It was explained that both the current director and a former director agreed that the committee functions best when department representatives are chosen in collaboration with the department Chairs.

*The mover and the seconder agreed to amend the MBA Program Committee Composition and Mandate to include responsibility for admission procedures and to delete the collaboration with department Chairs for the selection of MBA Committee representatives.*

The Chair commented that the MBA Program was not the only program without an admissions committee. Students are admitted based on specific criteria. In the past the MBA lost excellent candidates due to delays caused by the inability to find a suitable date for all committee members to meet. He questioned the rationale for changing a structure that works efficiently as demonstrated by the outstanding quality of newly admitted MBA students.

*The motion was carried unanimously as amended.*

iv) Report of the Committee for the Selection of Distinguished Teaching Awards – JMSB-2004-04A-05

G. Kanaan outlined the revisions to the mandate and composition for the Committee for the Selection of Distinguished Teaching Awards: (i) the selection committee is more open with only one past recipient as a member, (ii) an on-line applications system has been included, and (iii) the award for full-time and part-time faculty is identical.

*It was moved by G. Kanaan and seconded by B. Ibrahim that Council approve the mandate and composition of the Committee for the Selection of Distinguished Teaching Awards as presented JMSB-2004-04A-05.*

With regard to LTA eligibility, he advised that LTAs can qualify for the part-time category after four years, the required time for demonstrating a pattern of excellence.

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

IX Report: Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation – JMSB-2004-04A-06

D. Morin outlined the report and announced that Bianca Grohmann was the winner of the JMSB Distinguished Junior Researcher Award and MSc. Student, Karine Goneau,

won the Joe Kelly Graduate Award. The awards will be presented at convocation on June 11.

i) **AMBA Curriculum Revisions – JMSB-2004-04A-07**

*It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by G. Kanaan that Council approve the 2004-2005 Graduate Calendar changes to the International Aviation Program and the proposals for a new Graduate Diploma in Aviation Management and a new Graduate Certificate in Aviation Management as presented in document JMSB-2004-04A-07.*

D. Morin advised that diploma and certificate programs will open the Aviation specialty to a new clientele. The Program Director had been approached by students interested in adding an aviation component to their qualifications. Fees for the diploma and certificate programs will be pro rated AMBA fees.

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

ii) **Goodman Institute of Investment Management Curriculum Revisions – JMSB-2004-04A-08**

*It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by G. Lowenfeld that Council approve the 2004-2005 Graduate Calendar changes for the Diploma in Investment Management, the Master in Investment Management and the Investment MBA – Investment Management Option (MBA) as presented in document JMSB-2004-04A-08*

A discussion ensued regarding the transfer of credits with corresponding grades including C grades. There was objection to transferring students with C grades inasmuch as it places students in academic jeopardy. It was argued that the Program Directors would be in a position to judge a student's potential for success and would only make the transfer recommendation on a low -risk basis. The decision to transfer B- and C grades would not be automatic but would be at the discretion of the Program Director.

The inability to transfer credits earned in the diploma program to the masters program was questioned. The Chair suggested that a proposal to the School of Graduate Studies be brought to Council to try to deal with this long unresolved issue. It was commented that HEC allows the credits to be transferred if the student returns the diploma to the school.

It was proposed that the revisions be approved conditional on instituting the same name for all courses in the program rather than three different names, DIM, MIM and IMBA.

The question was called. (A. Robin and D. Morin – vote: 30 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions)

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

*It was moved by M. Magnan and seconded by G. Lowenfeld that the name changes to the courses in the Goodman Institute of Investment Management be considered and applied if possible.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

**iii) Undergraduate Curriculum Revisions – JMSB-2004-04A-09**

*It was moved by D. Morin and seconded by A. Robin that Council approve the revisions to the undergraduate curriculum for the 2004-2005 Undergraduate Calendar as presented in document JMSB-2004-04A-09.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

**X Report: Administrative Affairs and Human Resources**

B. Ibrahim reported that the work on the fourth floor of the GM building to connect the new Engineering building to the GM building has been conducted with minimal inconvenience to the occupants of the offices on the south wall. It is expected that the work on the connection will be finalized within the next three months.

Members of Council extended a vote of thanks to L. Sauras for her efforts to ensure that the work on the GM building is completed without undue disturbance to the occupants.

**XI Standing Report on the status of the new JMSB building**

There was no report.

**XII CGSA Report - JMSB-2004-04-14**

The CGSA Report was received.

**XIII Report: External Affairs and Executive Programs**

M. Magnan reported the success of the Best of the Best 2004 event that raised approximately \$155,000 for Ph.D. Student Fellowships and advised that the work on the annual campaign was in progress.

**XIV Report: Undergraduate Programs, Academic and Student Affairs**

There was no report.

**XV Reports from School Representatives on University Committees**

There were no reports from the representatives of the following committees:

- i) University Senate
- ii) Arts and Science Faculty Council
- iii) Senate Academic Planning and Priorities
- iv) Senate Academic Programs Committee
- v) Senate Research Committee
- vi) University Library Committee
- vii) Undergraduate Scholarships and Awards Sub-committee
- viii) Board of Governors
- ix) Council of the School of Graduate Studies

XVI CASA Report - JMSB-2004-04A-13

The CASA report was received. A. Robin encouraged the JMSB to host the first Pan-Canadian Commerce Games in 2007 and thanked everyone for his excellent learning experience both as a student and the President of CASA.

The Chair announced that A. Robin would join the Past Presidents Dinner this evening that brings together most of the CASA Presidents from 1982 forward. The goal is to get Past Presidents involved with JMSB by making the annual Past Presidents Dinner a tradition.

*It was moved by G. Kanaan and seconded by M. Magnan that a vote of thanks be extended to A. Robin for his efforts on behalf of the John Molson School of Business.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

XVII New Business

- i) Motion regarding JMSB Council Membership Revision - JMSB-2004-04A-10  
*It was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by Z. Gidengil that Council approve the revision to the Council composition to provide for representation at the rank of Lecturer or Senior Lecturer in accordance with the change in the CUFA collective agreement.*

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

- ii) Motion regarding faculty teaching in research-oriented programs – JMSB-2004-04A-11

The following resolution was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by F. Nebebe:

*WHEREAS it is highly desirable that faculty teaching in research-oriented programs should be active in research,  
WHEREAS faculty members active in research and teaching in the research-oriented programs motivate the students to do research,  
WHEREAS, JMSB should encourage faculty members to be active in research,  
WHEREAS, promotion of research is one of the key objectives of the JMSB,*

*BE IT RESOLVED that faculty members teaching in our research oriented programs should have at least one publication in a refereed journal (at least 2<sup>nd</sup> tier journal) during the preceding two years of teaching a course in such research-oriented programs.*

*New faculty members may be exempted from this rule during the first two years of their first contract.*

During the discussion members of Council commended S. Goyal for the spirit of the motion but generally agreed that it is the responsibility of department Chairs in collaboration with the Graduate Program Directors to ensure quality control in assigning only highly qualified faculty to teach in research-oriented programs.

The question was called (D. Peltier-Rivest, S. Betton – vote: 29 in favor, 2 opposed, 0 abstentions)

*The motion was defeated unanimously.*

- iii) Motions regarding the format of JMSB Council meetings – JMSB-2004-04A-12  
The following resolution was moved by A. Dhillon and seconded by S. Goyal:

*BE IT RESOLVED that all JMSB Faculty Council meetings be limited to a maximum duration of no more than 150 minutes;*

*BE IT RESOLVED that the JMSB Faculty Council Steering Committee must assign a maximum duration of discussion for each motion brought to Faculty after which time the motion will be called to question.*

It was agreed that the Chair would be empowered to extend discussion when the need arises.

*The motion was carried unanimously.*

XVIII Other Business

XIX Adjournment

*It was moved by S. Goyal and seconded by S. Betton that the meeting be adjourned.*

*The motion was carried unanimously*

The meeting was adjourned at 11:35.

XX Next meeting

The next regular meeting of Council is scheduled on Friday, May 14, 2004 in room GM302. The first portion of the meeting will be a closed session for the approval of spring Graduates.